## Malathion Use on Various Food and Forage Crops in Hawaii

Date: May 25, 2006

To: Teung Chin

CC: Thomas Moriarty, Rick Melnicoe

From: Cathy Tarutani

Subject: Malathion Proposed Application Values

Attachment 1 Attachment 2 Attachment 3

Teung,

Hawaii's comments on EPA's proposed application values for malathion and suggested changes for Table 1 are attached. (The ULV formulation is not an important product in Hawaii.)

We appreciate being allowed some extra time to comment on this issues, which is important to many of our growers.

If you have any questions or concerns, please contact either Mike Kawate (mike@hpirs.stjohn.hawaii.edu, 808/956-6008) or me.

Mahalo, Cathy

#### Cathy Tarutani

Department of Plant and Environmental Protection Sciences 3190 Maile Way
St John Plant Science Lab., Room 017
University of Hawaii
Honolulu, HI 96822
voice: 808-956-2004

voice: 808-956-2004 fax: 808-956-9675

# UNIVERSITY OF HAWAI'I AT MĀNOA

College of Tropical Agriculture and Human Resources

**Department of Plant and Environmental Protection Sciences** 

May 25, 2006

Teung F. Chin, Ph.D.
Office of Pest Management Policy
Agricultural Research Service
U.S. Department of Agriculture
4700 River Road, Unit 149
Riverdale, MD 20737-1237

Subject: Comments in response to the "Request to Review and Provide Comments on Proposed Use Rates for Commercial Agricultural Crops for Malathion."

The following comments are being submitted in response to the Request to Review and Provide Comments on Proposed Use Rates for Commercial Agricultural Crops for Malathion." These comments are being submitted on behalf of the Western Integrated Pest Management Center and provide input on the use of malathion on various food and forage in Hawai'i.

Dear Teung,

Attached is information about malathion use on various food and forage crops in Hawai'i. For Table 1, where our stakeholders are proposing values other than EPA proposed, we have indicated our stakeholders proposed values and comments in red. Also attached are the answers to your questions for some of the crops concerned.

Malathion is used on a number of crops so it is difficult to characterize every scenario in which it may be used. It is a very inexpensive insecticide that is not an RUP so availability and use are widespread. It is effective on some species of aphids and on caterpillars, which are the main vegetable crop uses for the product in Hawaii. Malathion is of particular importance to **papaya** producers, especially for the control of Stevens leafhopper, white peach scale, and possibly the papaya mealybug.

There is a great deal of concern about the EPA's Proposed Restricted Entry Intervals (REI). Growers of some **vegetable crops**, such as cucurbits, harvest on a daily basis for the duration of the harvest period. For **watercress**, and other crops, extending the REI to 2+ days will make it difficult for workers to get to harvest sites if they have to access them through fields that are still under REI. Since many crops in Hawaii (in particular **vegetables** and **papaya** and **mango**) are constantly being harvested and planted and land, for the most part is limited, there are concerns about major logistical problems associated with having to hand harvest and work around areas that still may be under REI. With sequential plantings being placed side by side a constant awareness and reminder would need to be established so that a worker doesn't, mistakenly, wander in to an area under REI even though it could be right next to an area being harvested. If the proposed REIs are incorporated into malathion product labels, it may be difficult for many farmers to use the product at all and for the **watercress industry** that could be devastating since very few insecticide alternatives exist.

# UNIVERSITY OF HAWAI'I AT MĀNOA

College of Tropical Agriculture and Human Resources

**Department of Plant and Environmental Protection Sciences** 

For **forage grasses and pasture and rangeland**, there is only one product available for the control of the yellow sugarcane aphid (YSA) in Hawai'i at the registrants' supported rate, control is not 100%.

**Macadamia nut growers** have expressed concern that the proposed maximum of two(s) applications per year could leave them without sufficient tools to deal with an invasion of introduced species.

Malathion is an important chemistry for Hawai'i's **seed corn** industry for the control of earworms in seed corn fields. This is even more critical in Hawai'i where the options of earworm chemistries is very limited. Seed corn producers are concerned with and opposed to the increase from the current 12-hour REI to the proposed 6-day REI for detasseling and the 24-hour REI for other activities.

Comments submitted by:

Mike Kawate

Pesticide Registration Specialist

Voice: 808-956-6008

mike@hpirs.stjohn.hawaii.edu

Cathy Tarutani

Caty Tanth

Educational Specialist Voice: 808-956-2004

cathy@hpirs.stjohn.hawaii.edu

3050 Maile Way, Gilmore Hall 310, Honolulu, Hawai'i 96822

Telephone: (808) 956-7076, Facsimile: (808) 956-2428, E-mail: peps@ctahr.hawaii.edu, Web: www2.ctahr.hawaii.edu

An Equal Opportunity/Affirmative Action Institution

 $\textbf{Table 1. Malathion: Supported Maximum and Typical Use Patterns Compared to Changes Proposed by EPA for the EC, WP \\ \textbf{and Dust Formulations} \ (\textbf{updated April 4, 2006})$ 

G 4 1G		Maximum Single	Maximum Number of	Minimum Application	Minimum Pre-		REI*		= Notes
Supported Crop		Application Rate (1b a.i./A)	Applications per Year	Interval (days)	Harvest Interval (days)	Current	Current EPA Proposed	Needed	Notes
	Commented	1.05	1 2	1.4	1 0	1	I	1	T
Alfalfa	Supported	1.25	2 per cutting	14	0	-			
	Average	1.0	1.4 per cutting	-	-	12 hours	24 hours		
	EPA proposed	1.25	2 per cutting	14	0				
	-	-	1	<u> </u>	1	<u> </u>	<u> </u>	1	1
	Supported	3.75	4	7	6				
Apricots	Average	1.4	1	-	-	12 hours	4 days		
1	EPA Proposed	1.5	2	7	6				
	Supported	1.25	9	7	1				0.77
Asparagus	Average	1.25	2.1	7		12 hours	24 hours		OK
	EPA proposed	1.25	2	7	1				
	Supported	4.70	2	30	7				
	Average	4.5	1.1	-	-	1			
Avocado	EPA proposed	CA: 4.7	2	30	7	12 hours	5 days		
		FL: 4.7	1	-	7				
	Supported	1.25	3	7	7				
Barley	Average	0.8	1			12 hours	24 hours		
,	EPA Proposed	1.25	2	7	7				

Table 1. Malathion: Supported Maximum and Typical Use Patterns Compared to Changes Proposed by EPA for the EC, WP and Dust Formulations (updated April 4, 2006)

Summantal Cuan		Maximum Single Application	Maximum Number of	Minimum Application	Minimum Pre- Harvest		REI		Notes
Supported Crop		Rate (1b a.i./A)	Applications per Year	Interval (days)	Interval (days)	Current	Current EPA Proposed	Needed	Notes
	Supported	1.25	5	7	7				
Beets, garden	Average	2.1	1			12 hours	2 days		
	EPA Proposed	1.25	3	7	7				
	Supported	2.0	4	7	1				
Blackberry	Average	2.0	1.2	7	-	12 hours	2 days		
-	EPA Proposed	2.0	4	7	1				
	Supported	2.0	4	7	1				
Boysenberry	Average	1.2	3	7		12 hours	4 days		
	EPA proposed	2.0	2	7	1				
	Supported	1.25	5	7	2				Doesn't make sense,
Broccoli	Average	2.0	1	7		12 hours	3 days	12 hrs	the REI is longer
	EPA Proposed	1.25	1	7	2				than the PHI.
	Supported	1.25	5	7	2				
Broccoli raab	Average					12 hours	3 days		
	EPA Proposed	1.25	1	-	2				
		•		•	•	•		•	•
	Supported	1.25	5	7	2				Doesn't make sense,
Broccoli, Chinese	Average					12 hours	3 days	12 hrs	the REI is longer
,	EPA Proposed	1.25	1	_	2	1	1		than the PHI.

G 4 1 G		Maximum Single	Maximum Number of	Minimum Application	Minimum Pre-		REI		= Notes
Supported Crop		Application Rate (1b a.i./A)	Applications per Year	Interval (days)	Harvest Interval (days)	Current	Current EPA Proposed	Needed	Notes
	Supported	1.25	4	7	2				
Brussels sprouts	Average	1.4	1	7		12 hours	3 days		
	EPA Proposed	1.25	1	-	2				
	Supported	1.25	10	7	7				
Cabbage	Average	1.2	1.3	7		12 hours	3 days	12 hrs	
C	EPA proposed	1.25	2	7	7				
	Supported	1.0	6	7	1				
Cantaloupe	Average	0.5	1		1	12 hours	2 days	12 hrs	
	EPA Proposed	1.0	2	7	1				
	Supported	1.25	7	7	7				
Carrots	Average	2.5	1.8	7	-	12 hours	2 days		
	EPA Proposed	1.25	2	7	7				
						T	1	1	
	Supported	1.25	5	7	2				
Cauliflower	Supported Average	1.25 1.7	5	7 -	2 -	12 hours	3 days	12 hrs	
Cauliflower					+	12 hours	3 days	12 hrs	
Cauliflower	Average	1.7	1	-	-	12 hours	3 days	12 hrs	
Cauliflower	Average	1.7	1	-	-	12 hours	3 days	12 hrs	
Cauliflower	Average EPA Proposed	1.7 1.25	1		2	12 hours	3 days	12 hrs	

Summartal Cuar		Maximum Single	Maximum Number of	Minimum Application	Minimum Pre-		REI		= Notes
Supported Crop		Application Rate (1b a.i./A)	Applications per Year	Interval (days)	Harvest Interval (days)	Current	Current EPA Proposed	Needed	Notes
	Supported	1.56	2	7	0				
Chayote root	Average	1.56	1	?		12 hours	3 days		
Chayote 100t	EPA proposed	1.56	2	7	0				
	•	•		•	•	•			
	Supported	1.88	3	7	1				
Chayote fruit	Average	1.75	2	7		12 hours	3 days		
	EPA proposed	1.75	2	7	1				
	Supported	3.75	6	7	3				
Cherries (sweet)	Average	2.0	3.1	7		12 hours	3 days		
	EPA proposed	1.75	4	7	3				
	Supported	3.75	6	7	3				
Cherries (tart)	Average	2.0	3.1	7		12 hours	3 days		
	EPA proposed	1.75	4	7	3				
	Supported	5.0	4	7	2				Proposed rates derived
Chestnut	Average					12 hours	4 days		from other nut crops.
	EPA proposed	2.5	3	7	2				
	Supported	1.25	10	7	7				
	* *		ļ -	-	+	-1	1	1	
Chinese greens (Chinese cabbage)	Average					12 hours	3 days	12 hrs	

Table 1. Malathion: Supported Maximum and Typical Use Patterns Compared to Changes Proposed by EPA for the EC, WP and Dust Formulations (updated April 4, 2006)

Commented Comm		Maximum Single	Maximum Number of	Minimum Application	Minimum Pre-		REI		= Notes
Supported Crop		Application Rate (1b a.i./A)	Applications per Year	Interval (days)	Harvest Interval (days)	Current	Current EPA Proposed	Needed	Notes
	Supported	1.25	2 per cutting	14	0				EPA requests
	Average			14	0	]			information on typical number of cuttings per
Clover	EPA Proposed	1.25	2 per cutting	14	0	12 hours	24 hours		year, or alternatively typical number of crops per year.
Collards	Supported	1.25	10	7	7	12 hours	2 days	12 hrs	
Collards	Average	1.25	6	7	5	12 1100118	2 days	12 1118	
	EPA Proposed	1.25	3	7	7	1			
,									
	Supported	1.25	3	7	7		6 days for		
	Average	1	1.2	3	5	1	detassling and hand		This is unacceptable. Detasseling is timing
Corn, field	EPA Proposed	1.0	2	7	7	12 hours	harvesting  24 hours day for all other activities	12 hrs	critical. Increasing the REI to 6 days will probably eliminate the use of malathion in field corn.
	Supported	1.25	5	5	5		6 days for		
	Average						detassling and hand		
Corn, sweet	EPA Proposed	1.0	2	7	5	12 hours	harvesting  24 hours for all other activities	12 hrs	Same as above, especially as relates to hand harvesting.

Summartal Cuar	_	Maximum Single Application	Maximum Number of	Minimum Application	Minimum Pre-		REI		= Notes
Supported Crop		Rate (1b a.i./A)	Applications per Year	Interval (days)	Harvest Interval (days)	Current	Current EPA Proposed	Needed	Notes
	Supported	1.88	3	7	1				Doesn't make sense,
Cucumber	Average	1.1	1.4	7	1	12 hours	3 days	12 hrs	the REI is longer
	EPA Proposed	1.75	2	7	1				than the PHI.
	Supported								
Dandelion	Average					12 hours	3 days		
	EPA Proposed	1.25	2	7	7				
Dates	Supported	4.25	6	7	?		3 days		
Dutes	Average	2.5	2	7		12 hours	3 days		Dust Formulation only
	EPA Proposed	2.75	3	7	?				
	Supported	2.0	4	7	1				
Dewberry	Average					12 hours	2 days		
	EPA Proposed	2.0	2	7	1				
	Supported	3.43	5	5	3				Doesn't make sense,
Eggplant	Average	1.56	5	5	3	12 hours	3 days	12 hrs	the REI is longer
-55P1	EPA Proposed	1.6 1.56	1	5 7	3				than the PHI.
	LI A I Toposed	1.56	4	/	3				1
	Supported	3.43	5	5	3				Doesn't make sense,
Eggplant, oriental	Average	1.56	5	5	1	12 hours	3 days	12 hrs	the REI is longer
	EPA Proposed	1.50	4	7	2				than the PHI.
	LEA Floposed	1.56	4	7	3				

g 1.G		Maximum Single	Maximum Number of	Minimum Application	Minimum Pre-		REI		
Supported Crop		Application Rate (1b a.i./A)	Applications per Year	Interval (days)	Harvest Interval (days)	Current	Current EPA Proposed	Needed	Notes
	Supported								
Endive (escarole)	Average					12 hours	3 days		
	EPA Proposed	1.25	2	7	7				
	Supported	2.5	3	5	5				
Figs	Average	2.0	1	5		12 hours	3 days		
	EPA Proposed	2.0	2	5	5				
	Supported	0.5	1	N/A	52 (?)				EPA requests
Flax	Average	1.0	1			12 hours	12 hours		information on typical Preharvest Interval for
	EPA Proposed	0.5	1		52 (?)				flax
	Supported	1.56	5	7	3				
Garlic	Average	1.8	2.1	7	-	12 hours	3 days		
	EPA Proposed	1.56	3	7	3				
	Supported								EPA requests
	Average								additional information
Grain crops	EPA Proposed								on types of grain crops treated with malathion, and typical application rates.

Table 1. Malathion: Supported Maximum and Typical Use Patterns Compared to Changes Proposed by EPA for the EC, WP and Dust Formulations (updated April 4, 2006)

C		Maximum Single	Maximum Number of	Minimum Application	Minimum Pre-		REI		= Notes
Supported Crop		Application Rate (1b a.i./A)	Applications per Year	Interval (days)	Harvest Interval (days)	Current	Current EPA Proposed	Needed	= Notes
	Supported								EPA requests
Grain elevators	Average	0.4	1						information on typical application rates and
Grain elevators	EPA Proposed								typical application practices.
Grains, stored (Includes barley, corn, oats, rye and	Supported	Supported	Loading: 0.624 lbs ai/1000 bushels Storage: 0.312 lbs ai/100 bushels	3 per storage period	60				Dust formulation only  EPA requests information on typical application rates and application practices for stored grains.
wheat)	Average								
	EPA Proposed								1 application of the 57 EC is usually made to empty grain bin prior to treatment with dust
	Supported	6.25	3	30	7				Typical rates reported
	Average	0.5	3.7	-	-				for grapefruit may reflect ULV
Grapefruit	EPA Proposed	0.75	3	30	7	12 hours	5 days		formulation rates.  EPA requests typical application rates (EC, WP formulations) if these are different than

Comment of Comme		Maximum Single	Maximum Number of	Minimum Application	Minimum Pre-		REI		= Notes
Supported Crop		Application Rate (1b a.i./A)	Applications per Year	Interval (days)	Harvest Interval (days)	Current	Current EPA Proposed	Needed	Notes
	T. G 1	1	1	1	T .	T	T	<u> </u>	I EDA
	Supported	1.88	2	14	3				EPA notes that typical rates to grapes is
	Average	2.2	1.4	14		-			higher than the supported.
Grapes, raisin, table, wine	EPA Proposed	1.88	2	14	3	12 hours	5 days		EPA requests information on potential impact if application rate is lowered to the "supported" values.
	Supported	1.25	1	-	0				
Grasses, Bermuda, forage	Average					12 hours	24 hours		
Definida, forage	EPA Proposed	1.25	1	-	0				
	Supported	1.25	13	3	2				Typical application
Guava	ActualHawai'i	0.9375	2			12 hours	2 days		information is also being generated by
	EPA Proposed				2				Univ. of Hawaii.
	Supported								EPA requests
Hay, other	Average					12 hours	24 hours		additional information on typical application
may, omer	EPA Proposed					12 Hours			rates on malathion applications to hay.
	Supported	0.63	3	7	10				
Hops	Average	.9375				12 hours	12 hr		
	EPA Proposed	0.63	3	7	10	1			

g 1 G		Maximum Single	Maximum Number of	Minimum Application	Minimum Pre-		REI		N
Supported Crop		Application Rate (1b a.i./A)	Applications per Year	Interval (days)	Harvest Interval (days)	Current	Current EPA Proposed	Needed	Notes
				1		<u> </u>			1
	Supported	1.25	5	7	7				
Horseradish	Average	1.25	3	7		12 hours	2 days		
	EPA Proposed	1.25	3	7	7				
	Supported	1.25	10	7	7				
Kale Average EPA Proposed	Average	1.9	1.7	7	-	12 hours	2 days		
	EPA Proposed	1.25	3	7	2	1			
V oblach:	Supported	1.25	10	7	7	12 hours	3 days		
Kohlrabi	Average	1.25		7	7	12 hours	3 days		
	EPA Proposed	1.25	2	7	7	-			
	'		-	1	•		•		
	Supported	6.25	3	30	7				EPA requests
	Average								additional information on typical malathion
Kumquats	EPA Proposed	0.75	2	30	7	12 hours	5 days		rates applied to kumquats.  EPA proposed values are based upon typical rates reported for oranges (citrus) and may reflect ULV formulation rates, not EC, WP formulation

Table 1. Malathion: Supported Maximum and Typical Use Patterns Compared to Changes Proposed by EPA for the EC, WP and Dust Formulations (updated April 4, 2006)

Summanted Cuan		Maximum Single Application	Maximum Number of	Minimum Application	Minimum Pre- Harvest		REI		- Notes
Supported Crop		Rate (1b a.i./A)	Applications per Year	Interval (days)	Interval (days)	Current	Current PA Proposed	Needed	Notes
1	T .			1		T	1	1	1
	Supported	1.56	5	7	3				
Leeks	Average					12 hours	3 days		
	EPA Proposed	1.56	2	7	3				
	Supported	6.25	3	30	7				
Lemons	Average	1.2	1	30	7	12 hours	5 days		
	EPA Proposed	0.75	2	30	7				
Lespedeza	Supported Average EPA Proposed	1.25	2 per cutting	14	0	12 hours	24 hours		EPA requests additional information on the typical number
	EFA Floposed	1.25	2 per cutting	14					of cuttings per year.
	Supported	1.88	6	6	14				
Lettuce, head	Average	2.0	1.1	7	-	12 hours	3 days	12 hrs	
	EPA Proposed	1.88	2	6	14				
	Supported	1.88	6	5	14				
Lettuce, leaf	Average	2.0	1.1	7	-	12 hours	3 days	12 hrs	
	EPA Proposed	1.88	2	5	14				
	Supported	6.25	3	30	7				
Limes	Average	1.4	1	30	7	12 hours	5 days	12 hrs	
			i e	1					•

Table 1. Malathion: Supported Maximum and Typical Use Patterns Compared to Changes Proposed by EPA for the EC, WP and Dust Formulations (updated April 4, 2006)

Supported Crop		Maximum Single Application	Maximum Number of	Minimum Application	Minimum Pre- Harvest		REI		- Notes
Supported Crop		Rate (1b a.i./A)	Applications per Year	Interval (days)	Interval (days)	Current	Current PA Proposed	Needed	Notes
	Supported	2.0	4	7	1				
Loganberry	Average	2.0	4	7		12 hours	24 hours		
	EPA Proposed	2.0	2	7	1				
									•
	Supported	0.94	7	7	1				*Under the current
	Average								situation two applica- tions of malathion per
Macadamia nut	EPA Proposed	0.94	2*	7	1	12 hours	24 hours		year is acceptable to Hawaii's macadamia growers. However, the growers expressed concerns about their lack of ability to control any new economic pests which may be introduced. If such an introduction should occur, there would be the need for a product such as malathion for immediate control/eradication of the new pest.
	Supported	1.25	8	7	1				Typical malathion use
Mango	ActualHawai'i	0.9375	10	14	1	12 hours	2 days	24 hours	information on mango
Truing0	EPA Proposed	tbd	tbd	tbd	1				is also being generated by Univ. of Hawaii
Melons:	Supported	1.0	6	7	1	12 hours	2 days	12 hrs	Doesn't make sense,
Cantaloupe, water	Average	0.9	1	7	1	1			the REI is longer

Table 1. Malathion: Supported Maximum and Typical Use Patterns Compared to Changes Proposed by EPA for the EC, WP and Dust Formulations (updated April 4, 2006)

and honeydew	EPA Proposed	1.0	2	7	1				than the PHI.
	Supported	0.94	3	7	7				
Mint	Average					12 hours	2 days	12 hrs	
	EPA Proposed	0.94	3	7	7				

Comments I Comm		Maximum Single	Maximum Number of	Minimum Application	Minimum Pre-		REI		Notes
Supported Crop		Application Rate (1b a.i./A)	Applications per Year	Interval (days)	Harvest Interval (days)	Current	Current EPA Proposed	Needed	Notes
	Supported	1.7	4	3	1				
Mushrooms	Average					12 hours	(?)		
	EPA Proposed	tbd	tbd	tbd	1				
	Supported	1.25	6	3 7	7				
Mustard greens	Average	2.50	3	7	- /	12 hours	2 days	12 hrs	
Transmit ground		1.25	6	,	5	1			
	EPA Proposed	1.25	3	7	7				
	Supported	3.75	4	7	7				EPA notes that typical
	Average	9.0	1.4	14	7				rates to nectarines is
Nectarines	EPA Proposed	3.0	3	7	7	12 hours	4 days		greater than the supported rate.  EPA requests information on potential impact if application rate is

and Dust Fo	ormulations (upd	lated April 4, 200	6)	<u> </u>			T	T	1 1 1
									lowered to the proposed values.
	Supported	2.5	3	7	7				
Nuts	Average					12 hours	4 days		
	EPA Proposed	2.5	3	7	7				
	Supported	1.25	3	7	7				
Oats	Average	1.1	1		7	12 hours	24 hours		
	EPA Proposed	1	2	7	7				
a . 10		Maximum Single	Maximum Number of	Minimum Application	Minimum Pre-		REI		N.
Supported Crop		Application Rate (1b a.i./A)	Applications per Year	Interval (days)	Harvest Interval (days)	Current	Current EPA Proposed	Needed	Notes
	•		•	•	•	-	-	1	•
	Supported	1.5	6	7	1				EPA proposes to
	Average	1.2	4.8	7	-				remove aerial application to Okra.
Okra	EPA Proposed	1.2	5	7	1	12 hours	24 hour		Please provide information on the necessity of aerial application for application of malathion to okra.
	Supported	1.56	6	7	3				
Onions, bulb	Average	1.2	1.5	7	-	12 hours	3 days	12 hrs	
	EPA Proposed	1.56	2	7	3				
			1 .	7	1 2				
	Supported	1.56	6	7	3				
Onions, green	Supported Average EPA Proposed	1.56	6	/	3	12 hours	3 days	12 hrs	

 $\textbf{Table 1. Malathion: Supported Maximum and Typical Use Patterns Compared to Changes Proposed by EPA for the EC, WP \\ \textbf{and Dust Formulations} \ (\textbf{updated April 4, 2006})$ 

	Supported	6.25	3	30	7				
	Average	0.6	1.2	30	7				EPA's average rates may reflect ULV
	EPA Proposed								rather than the EC
Oranges		0.75	2	30	7	12 hours	5 days	12 hrs	Please provide info. on typical rates (EC, WP formulation) if different from reported values.
	Supported	1.25	13	3	1				Typical information
Papaya	ActualHawai'i	1.25	15	3	1	12 hours	2 days	12 hrs	from Univ. of Hawaii
	EPA Proposed	tbd	tbd	tbd	1				is being generated.
		Maximum Single	Maximum Number of	Minimum Application	Minimum Pre-		REI		
Supported Crop		Application Rate (1b a.i./A)	Applications per Year	Interval (days)	Harvest Interval (days)	Current	Current EPA Proposed	Needed	Notes
	Supported	1.5	2	7	2 or 7				EPA request
	Average								information on typical PHI.
1									1111.
Parsley	EPA Proposed	1.5	2	7		12 hours	3 days	12 hrs	PHI reported here reflects PHI for related crops, broccoli, and cabbage/mustard greens respectively.
Parsley	EPA Proposed	1.5	2	7		12 hours	3 days	12 hrs	reflects PHI for related crops, broccoli, and cabbage/mustard
Parsley					7	12 hours	3 days	12 hrs	reflects PHI for related crops, broccoli, and cabbage/mustard
	Supported	1.5	5	7	7			12 hrs	reflects PHI for related crops, broccoli, and cabbage/mustard
Parsley	Supported Average	1.25	5	7		12 hours	3 days	12 hrs	reflects PHI for related crops, broccoli, and cabbage/mustard
	Supported				7 7			12 hrs	reflects PHI for related crops, broccoli, and cabbage/mustard
	Supported Average	1.25	5	7				12 hrs	reflects PHI for related crops, broccoli, and cabbage/mustard
	Supported Average	1.25	5	7				12 hrs	reflects PHI for related crops, broccoli, and cabbage/mustard greens respectively.  Typical application
	Supported Average EPA Proposed	1.25	5 3	7 7	7			12 hrs	reflects PHI for related crops, broccoli, and cabbage/mustard greens respectively.

	Supported	0.9375	2	1			EPA requests
	Average	0.62	1.2				information on typical uses of malathion for
Pasture and rangeland	EPA Proposed	0.62	1	1	12 hours	(?)	"pasture and rangeland" which is other than the APHIS sponsored Grasshopper, Mormon cricket Program

Comments I Comm		Maximum Single	Maximum Number of	Minimum Application	Minimum Pre-		REI		Notes
Supported Crop		Application Rate (1b a.i./A)	Applications per Year	Interval (days)	Harvest Interval (days)	Current	Current EPA Proposed	Needed	Notes
	Supported	3.75	5	11	7				
Peaches	Average	3.8	2.4	-	7	12 hours	4 days		
	EPA Proposed	3.0	3	7	7				
_	Supported	1.25	5	7	1	12 h	2 4		
Pears	Average	1.7	2	7	1	12 hours	2 days		
	EPA Proposed	1.25	2	7	1				
	Supported	2.5	5	7	3				
Peas, green	Average	1.0	1	7	3	12 hours	3 days	12 hrs	
	EPA Proposed	1.0	2	7	3				
	Supported	2.5	5	7	3				
Peas, succulent	Average					12 hours	3 days		
	EPA Proposed	1.0	2	7	3				

	Supported	2.5	3	7	7				EPA proposes to
	Average	2.7	1.6						remove aerial application to pecan.
	EPA Proposed								application to pecali.
Pecans		2.5	2	7	7	12 hours	3 days		EPA requests information on the necessity of aerial application for malathion use on pecans.
	Supported	1.56	5	5	3	T	<u> </u>	1	<u> </u>
Dommono	Average	1.1	1	5	3	12 hours	24 hours	12 hrs	
Peppers	EPA Proposed	1.56	2	5	3	12 110013	24 110013	12 1115	
G 1.0	Errinoposed	Maximum Single	Maximum Number of	Minimum Application	Minimum Pre-		REI	<u> </u>	
Supported Crop		Application Rate (1b a.i./A)	Applications per Year	Interval (days)	Harvest Interval (days)	Current	Current EPA Proposed	Needed	Notes
		•							
	Supported	5.0	3	7	7				Application values are
Pineapple	Average	5.0	3	7	7	12 hours	12 hours		acceptable to
Pineapple		5.0	3	7	7	12 hours	12 hours		Application values are acceptable to Hawai'i's pineapple growers.
Pineapple	Average					12 hours	12 hours		acceptable to Hawai'i's pineapple
Pineapple	Average EPA Proposed	2.0	3	7	7	12 hours	12 hours		acceptable to Hawai'i's pineapple
	Average EPA Proposed  Supported	2.0	3	7	7	12 hours		12 hrs	acceptable to Hawai'i's pineapple
Pineapple Potatoes	Average EPA Proposed	2.0	3	7	7		12 hours 3 days	12 hrs	acceptable to Hawai'i's pineapple
	Average EPA Proposed  Supported Average	2.0 1.56 0.9	2 1	7 7 7	7 0 0			12 hrs	acceptable to Hawai'i's pineapple
	Average EPA Proposed  Supported Average	2.0 1.56 0.9	2 1	7 7 7	7 0 0			12 hrs	acceptable to Hawai'i's pineapple
	Average EPA Proposed  Supported Average EPA Proposed	2.0 1.56 0.9 1.56	3 2 1 2	7 7 7 7	7 0 0 0			12 hrs	acceptable to Hawai'i's pineapple
Potatoes	Average EPA Proposed  Supported Average EPA Proposed  Supported	2.0 1.56 0.9 1.56	3 2 1 2	7 7 7	7 0 0 0	12 hours	3 days		acceptable to Hawai'i's pineapple
Potatoes	Average EPA Proposed  Supported Average EPA Proposed  Supported Average Average	2.0 1.56 0.9 1.56	3 2 1 2 2 6 1.2	7 7 7 7	7 0 0 0 0	12 hours	3 days		acceptable to Hawai'i's pineapple
Potatoes	Average EPA Proposed  Supported Average EPA Proposed  Supported Average Average	2.0 1.56 0.9 1.56	3 2 1 2 2 6 1.2	7 7 7 7	7 0 0 0 0	12 hours	3 days		acceptable to Hawai'i's pineapple
Potatoes	Average EPA Proposed  Supported Average EPA Proposed  Supported Average EPA Proposed  EPA Proposed	2.0 1.56 0.9 1.56 1.0 1.4 1.0	3 2 1 2 2 6 1.2 2	7 7 7 7 7	7 0 0 0 0 0 1 1 1	12 hours	3 days		acceptable to Hawai'i's pineapple

	Supported	2.0	4	7	1				
Raspberry	Average	2.0	1.1	7	-	12 hours	24 hours		
	EPA Proposed	2.0	2	7	1				
	Supported	1.25	3	7	7				EPA wants all labels
	Average	0.6	1		7				to specify a 7 day
Rice	EPA proposed	1.25	2	7	7	12 hours	24 hours		holding time EPA requests additional information on a 7 day required holding time.
		Maximum Single	Maximum Number of	Minimum Application	Minimum Pre-		REI		
Supported Crop		Application Rate (1b a.i./A)	Applications per Year	Interval (days)	Harvest Interval (days)	Current	Current EPA Proposed	Needed	Notes
	Supported	1.25	5	7	7				
Rutabagas	Average			7	3	12 hours	2 days		
	EPA proposed	1.25	3	7	7				
	Supported	1.25	3	7	7				
Rye	Average					12 hours	24 hour		
	EPA Proposed	1.0	2	7	7				
	Supported	1.25	5	7	7				
Salsify	Average					12 hours	2 days		
-	EPA Proposed	1.25	3	7	7				
						1	1	T	ı
	Supported	1.56	5	7	3				
Shallots	Supported Average EPA Proposed	1.56	5	7	3	12 hours	3 days		

Table 1. Malathion: Supported Maximum and Typical Use Patterns Compared to Changes Proposed by EPA for the EC, WP and Dust Formulations (updated April 4, 2006)

	Supported	2.0	3	7	7				EPA proposes to
	Average	1.6	1.2	?	7				remove aerial uses EPA requests
Spinach	EPA proposed	2.0	2	7	7	12 hours	3 days	12 hrs	information on the necessity of aerial application for malathion use on spinach.
						•			
	Supported	1.88	3	7	1				
Squash, summer	Average	2.0	1.2	7	7	12 hours	3 days	12 hrs	
	EPA proposed	1.75	3	7	1				
C		Maximum Single	Maximum Number of	Minimum Application	Minimum Pre- Harvest		REI		Notes
Supported Crop		Application Rate (1b a.i./A)	Applications per Year	Interval (days)	Interval (days)	Current	Current EPA Proposed	Needed	Notes
	Supported	1.0	6	7	1				
Squash, winter	Average	1.0 2.0	6 1.2	7 7	1 7	12 hours	2 days		
Squash, winter					1 7 1	12 hours	2 days		
Squash, winter	Average	2.0	1.2	7		12 hours	2 days		
Squash, winter	Average	2.0	1.2	7		12 hours	2 days		EPA proposed to remove aerial
Squash, winter	Average EPA proposed	2.0	1.2	7 7	1	12 hours	2 days		remove aerial application
Squash, winter	Average EPA proposed  Supported	2.0 1.0	1.2	7 7 7	3	12 hours	2 days		remove aerial
	Average  EPA proposed  Supported  Average	2.0 1.0 2.0 2.0	1.2 3 6 3.4	7 7 7	3 -	-			remove aerial application EPA requests information on the necessity of aerial application for malathion use on
	Average  EPA proposed  Supported  Average	2.0 1.0 2.0 2.0	1.2 3 6 3.4	7 7 7	3 -	-			remove aerial application EPA requests information on the necessity of aerial application for malathion use on
	Average  EPA proposed  Supported  Average  EPA Proposed	2.0 1.0 2.0 2.0 2.0	1.2 3 6 3.4 4	7 7 7 7	3 - 3	-		12 hrs	remove aerial application EPA requests information on the necessity of aerial application for malathion use on

Table 1. Malathion: Supported Maximum and Typical Use Patterns Compared to Changes Proposed by EPA for the EC, WP and Dust Formulations (updated April 4, 2006)

	` 1	iteu 1 19111 1, 2000	<u>/</u>					
	Supported	1.5	2	7				Swiss chard is part of
	Average							the Leafy Vegetables (except Brassica)
Swiss chard	EPA proposed	1.5	2	7	12 hours	3 days	12 hrs	group for which data on the representative crop, celery, is missing.  EPA requests typical information on PHI.  Similar crop, lettuce has a 14 day PHI

g		Maximum Single	Maximum Number of	Minimum Application	Minimum Pre-		REI		- Notes
Supported Crop		Application Rate (1b a.i./A)	Applications per Year	Interval (days)	Harvest Interval (days)	Current	Current EPA Proposed	Needed	Notes
	Supported Average	6.25	3	30	7				This crop is supported by data on oranges
Tangelos	EPA proposed	0.75	2	30	7	12 hours	5 days		therefore the supported use pattern is based on oranges.  Additional information on typical application rates is requested as the reported typical rate may reflect ULV application, and not EC, WP applications.
	Connected	1 .05		1 00	T -	Т	Т	T	This area is assessmented
	Supported	6.25	3	30	7	-			This crop is supported on data for oranges
Tangerines	Average  EPA proposed	0.75	2	30	7	12 hours	5 days	12 hrs	therefore the supported use pattern in based on oranges.  Additional information on typical application rates is requested as

Table 1. Malathion: Supported Maximum and Typical Use Patterns Compared to Changes Proposed by EPA for the EC, WP and Dust Formulations (updated April 4, 2006)

and Dust I	ormulations (upda	iteu April 4, 2000	))					
								the reported typical rate may reflect ULV application, and not EC, WP applications.
	Supported	3.43 1.56	5 5	5 5	3 1	10.1	2.1	This crop is supported
Tomatillo	Average	1.2	3.3	?		12 hours	2 days	by data for tomato
	EPA proposed	1.56	4	5	3/1			

Supported Crop		Maximum Single Application	Maximum Number of Applications per Year	Minimum Application Interval (days)	Minimum Pre- Harvest Interval (days)	REI			Notes
		Rate (1b a.i./A)				Current	Current EPA Proposed	Needed	Notes
[ <del>-</del>	T = -					1	<u> </u>	1	T
	Supported	3.43 1.56	5 5	5 5	3		2 days	12 hrs	EPA proposes to remove aerial
	Average	1.2	1-3	5	3	_			application from tomato crop(s).
	EPA proposed								
Tomatoes		1.56	4	5	1	12 hours			EPA requests information on the necessity of aerial application for use of malathion on tomato crops.
	Supported	1.25	5	7	7	12 hours	2 days		
Turnips	Average			7	7				
	EPA proposed	1.25	3	7	7				
	Supported	2.5	3	7	7	12 hours	3 days		
Walnuts	Average	3.8	1	7					
	EPA Proposed	2.5	3	7	7				

Table 1. Malathion: Supported Maximum and Typical Use Patterns Compared to Changes Proposed by EPA for the EC, WP and Dust Formulations (updated April 4, 2006)

Watercress	Supported	1.25	5	3	3		2 days	12 hrs	Need up to 8
	Average		8			12 hours			applications per year. Very few options for this crop.
	EPA proposed	1.25	3	7	3				
Watermelons	Supported	1.0	6	7	1		2 days	12 hrs	
	Average	1.6	1.4	7	1	12 hours			
	EPA proposed	1.0	2	7	1				
Supported Crop		Maximum Single	Maximum Number of Applications per Year	Minimum Application Interval (days)	Minimum Pre- Harvest Interval (days)	REI			Notes
		Application Rate (1b a.i./A)				Current	Current EPA Proposed	Needed	Notes
	<u> </u>	<b>-</b>	<u> </u>	<u>'</u>		·			<u> </u>
Wheat, spring	Supported	1.25	3	7	7		24 hour		
	Average	0.7	1.0	7	7	12 hours			
	EPA proposed	1.0	2	7	7				
Wheat, winter	Supported	1.25	3	7	7		24 hour		
	Average	0.7	1.0	7	7	12 hours			
	EPA proposed	1.0	2	7	7				
Wild rice	Supported	1.25	3	7	7		24 hour		EPA proposes all
	Average	0.4	1						labels to specify a 7 day holding time for
	EPA proposed					12 hours			rice.
		1.25	2	7	7				EPA requests additional information on a 7 day required holding time.

Table 1. Malathion: Supported Maximum and Typical Use Patterns Compared to Changes Proposed by EPA for the EC, WP and Dust Formulations (updated April 4, 2006)

Yams	Supported	1.56	2	7	0				
	Average					12 hours	3 days	12 hrs	
	EPA proposed	1.56	2	7					

# Comments on Proposed Label Changes for Commercial Agricultural Crops for Malathion: **Hawaii**

## **Crop: Watercress**

## **Maximum Single Application Rate (1b a.i./A)**

1) Does the "EPA Proposed" Maximum Single Application Rate support your stakeholders' malathion needs?

Yes.

## Maximum Number of Applications per Year

1) Does the "EPA Proposed" Maximum Number or Applications per Year support your stakeholders' malathion needs?

No.

- 2) If there are instances where the "EPA Proposed" Maximum Number of Applications per Year does not support their malathion needs then:
  - (i) What is the maximum number of applications that are needed for this crop?

8

(ii) Why do growers need more applications than EPA proposes?

There are very few chemical control products for this crop.

(iii) How often do growers need more applications than EPA proposes?

Annually.

#### **Minimum Application Interval (days)**

1) Does the "EPA Proposed" Minimum Application Interval support your stakeholders' malathion needs?

Yes.

#### **EPA Proposed Restricted Entry Interval (REI)**

(i) Does the *Current* EPA Proposed REI interfere with your stakeholders' typical cultural practices for this crop?

Yes.

(ii) How or why does the "Current EPA Proposed" REI interfere with the practices for this crop?

Harvesters could not travel through field to get to plots that need to be harvested.

(iii) What is an acceptable REI for this crop?

12 hours.

# Crop: Cucumber

### Maximum Single Application Rate (1b a.i./A)

1) Does the "EPA Proposed" Maximum Single Application Rate support your stakeholders' malathion needs?

Yes.

## **Maximum Number of Applications per Year**

1) Does the "EPA Proposed" Maximum Number or Applications per Year support your stakeholders' malathion needs?

Yes.

# **Minimum Application Interval (days)**

1) Does the "EPA Proposed" Minimum Application Interval support your stakeholders' malathion needs?

Yes.

## **EPA Proposed Restricted Entry Interval (REI)**

(i) Does the *Current* EPA Proposed REI interfere with your stakeholders' typical cultural practices for this crop?

Yes.

(ii) How or why does the "Current EPA Proposed" REI interfere with the practices for this crop?

Workers are in the field on a daily basis performing activities such as harvesting and weeding.

(iii) What is an acceptable REI for this crop?

18 hours.

## Crop: Papaya

#### **Maximum Single Application Rate (1b a.i./A)**

1) Does the "EPA Proposed" Maximum Single Application Rate support your stakeholders' malathion needs?

N/A

- 2) If there are instances where the "EPA Proposed" Maximum Single Application Rate does not support their malathion needs then:
  - (i) What are the application rates that are needed for this crop?

1.25 lb ai/A

(ii) Why do growers need an application rate other than that which EPA proposes?

N/A

(iii) How often do growers need application rates other than that being proposed by EPA?

N/A

#### **Maximum Number of Applications per Year**

1) Does the "EPA Proposed" Maximum Number of Applications per Year support your stakeholders' malathion needs?

N/A

- 2) If there are instances where the "EPA Proposed" Maximum Number of Applications per Year does not support their malathion needs then:
  - (i) What is the maximum number of applications that are needed for this crop?

15

(ii) Why do growers need 15 applications per year?

Many applications are needed because of the insect pest problems in papaya, especially, Stevens leafhopper, white peach scale, and possibly the papaya mealybug. White peach scale is a relatively recent introduction which is currently found only on the islands of Hawaii (where 92% of papaya production is located) and Kauai. White peach scale is a serious post-harvest pest and can result in rejection of export shipments if found.

(iii) How often do growers need more applications than EPA proposes?

The number of applications needed is dependent on pest pressures and environmental conditions.

## **Minimum Application Interval (days)**

1) Does the "EPA Proposed" Minimum Application Interval support your stakeholders' malathion needs?

N/A

- 2) If there are instances where the "EPA Proposed" Minimum Application Interval does not support your stakeholders' malathion needs then:
  - (i) What is the Minimum Application Interval that is needed for this crop (in days)?

3 days

(ii) Why do growers need a Minimum Application Interval of three (3) days?

There are events where populations of pests (leafhoppers) explode and growers will need to return to the field to achieve control. This would occur for two or three applications.

More commonly, for leafhoppers or white peach scale control, growers will spray at one- to two-week intervals for two or three applications. They will not spray for another month or two. Then, they will spray once per month.

Few alternatives exist for these pests on papaya.

(iii) How often do growers need the requested minimum application interval?

N/A

#### **EPA Proposed Restricted Entry Interval (REI)**

- (i) Does the *Current* EPA Proposed REI interfere with your stakeholders' typical cultural practices for this crop?
  Yes.
- (ii) How or why does the "Current EPA Proposed" REI interfere with the practices for this crop?

Growers need to get back into the field as soon as possible, often the next day to weed, fertilize, trim, rogue, re-plant, reapply pesticides (when pest pressures require application prior to their next scheduled spray). Rain can also interfere with these activities and may necessitate workers returning to the field shortly after malathion application.

(iii) What is an acceptable REI for this crop?

12 hours.

## **Crop: Macadamia Nuts**

#### **Maximum Single Application Rate (1b a.i./A)**

1) Does the "EPA Proposed" Maximum Single Application Rate support your stakeholders' malathion needs?

Yes.

#### Maximum Number of Applications per Year

1) Does the "EPA Proposed" Maximum Number of Applications per Year support your stakeholders' malathion needs?

Yes, but only under current conditions. The growers expressed concerned about their lack of ability to control any new economic pests which may be introduced. If such an introduction should occur, there would be the need for a product such as malathion for immediate control/eradication of the new pest

- 2) If there are instances where the "EPA Proposed" Maximum Number of Applications per Year does not support their malathion needs then:
  - (i) What is the maximum number of applications that are needed for this crop?
  - (ii) Why do growers need more applications than EPA proposes?

Malathion is an effective tool and can be a good deterrent to a newly introduced insect pest. And it is highly probable that multiple treatments with malathion may be necessary to eradicate these new pests if they are found in mature orchards with full tree canopies where thorough coverage is required.

Hawaii's ecosystem and agricultural crops are vulnerable to introductions of invasive species. While not all introduced species become established or become agricultural pests, a risk assessment study at the Kahului Airport intercepted 125 insect species not previously known in Hawaii for a sampling period of 130 days, for an average of almost one insect species per day. Most of the agriculturally important pests of Hawai'i are introduced species.

The *Pest Management Strategic Plan for Macadamia Nut Production is Hawaii* has identified seven insect pest groups which are economically or potentially economically important to macadamia nut production in Hawai'i. However, in South Africa, the world's third largest producer of macadamia nuts, there are some 60 insect and two mite species identified which are known to attack macadamia trees and fruit. Of these, stink bugs are the most important and in addition to the green stinkbug, *Nezara viridula* (L.) which is also a serious problem in Hawai'i, there are more than 30 other stinkbug species attack the flowers and developing nuts. In Australia, more than 150 that damage macadamia have been reported.

An emerging and possibly critical new pest in Hawai'i is the macadamia felted coccid (*Eriococcus ironsidei*/Williams) (Hemiptera: Eriococcidae). This insect was first collected from macadamia trees in the South Kona area in March 2005 and later was positively identified. Some areas became heavily

infested with this scale. This insect is originally from Australia, where it can become a severe problem on macadamia nut trees.

Malathion was not the main tool to manage this recently introduced pest. However, the concern of the macadamia nut growers for options in the event of an introduction of a potentially seriously damaging insect pest is not unfounded.

(iii) How often do growers need more applications than EPA proposes?

Unpredictable.

## **Minimum Application Interval (days)**

3) Does the "EPA Proposed" Minimum Application Interval support your stakeholders' malathion needs?

Yes.

#### **EPA Proposed Restricted Entry Interval (REI)**

(i) Does the *Current* EPA Proposed REI interfere with your stakeholders' typical cultural practices for this crop?

No.

#### **Crop: Seed Corn**

### **Maximum Single Application Rate (1b a.i./A)**

1) Does the "EPA Proposed" Maximum Single Application Rate support your stakeholders' malathion needs?

Yes.

### **Maximum Number of Applications per Year**

1) Does the "EPA Proposed" Maximum Number or Applications per Year support your stakeholders' malathion needs?

Yes.

#### **Minimum Application Interval (days)**

1) Does the "EPA Proposed" Minimum Application Interval support your stakeholders' malathion needs?

Yes.

#### **EPA Proposed Restricted Entry Interval (REI)**

(i) Does the *Current* EPA Proposed REI interfere with your stakeholders' typical cultural practices for this crop?

Yes.

(ii) How or why does the "Current EPA Proposed" REI interfere with the practices for this crop?

The industry in Hawai'i is concerned with and **opposed** to the 6 day restricted entry interval for detasseling and the 24 hour REI for all other activities (instead of the current 12 hour REI).

Malathion is used almost exclusively at time of pollination in corn nurseries and top cross/foundation seed production fields. Malathion helps control earworms that attack corn ears through the silk. It is at the time of silking when malathion is sprayed to control this pest. In top cross/foundation fields the female plants need to be detasseled before the same female plant silks emerge (thus assuring cross pollination and hybrid seed production). Detasseling requires several trips over several days through the same field in order to assure purity of the F1 seed produced from the cross pollination. A six day interval would not allow anyone into the field to complete the task of detasseling.

The industry is also **opposed** to the EPA suggested 24 hour REI for all other activities in seed corn fields from the standpoint that 1 full pollination day would be lost in the 24 hour cycle. Anyone who has pollinated corn nurseries understands that pollination windows are narrow and that to be locked out of an actively pollinating field for 24 hours hurts opportunities to make the desired hand pollinations. Twelve hour REI's are manageable from the standpoint that nurseries can be sprayed late in the afternoon and re entered the following morning, still within legal limits of the REI.

(iii) What is an acceptable REI for this crop?

12 hours.

## Crop: Grasses, Bermuda, forage, Pasture and Rangeland

#### Maximum Single Application Rate (1b a.i./A)

1) Does the "EPA Proposed" Maximum Single Application Rate support your stakeholders' malathion needs?

NO, there is no consistency for the maximum single application rate. For example, the value for grasses, bermuda and forage is 1.25 lb. ai/A and the maximum value for pasture and rangelands, which consist of grasses and forage is 0.62 .b ai/A. The maximum single application rate should be made consistent at 1.25 lb. ai/A for all categories as they are similar.

- 2) If there are instances where the "EPA Proposed" Maximum Single Application Rate does not support their malathion needs then:
  - (i) What are the application rates that are needed for this crop?

The proposed rate for pasture and rangelands (minimum rate of 0.62 lb ai/A) is below the rate supported by the registrants' and should remain in the range of 0.9375 to 1.25 lb ai/A to provide adequate control of the yellow sugarcane aphid (*Sipha flava*, Forbes) in Hawai'i.

(ii) Why do growers need an application rate other than that which EPA proposes?

There is only one product formulation available for the control of the yellow sugarcane aphid (YSA) in Hawai'i and at the registrants' supported rate, control is not 100%. The lower rate proposed by EPA has not been tested or proven to be effective in the field, thus should not be lowered until evaluated.

(iii) How often do growers need application rates other than that being proposed by EPA?

The YSA population dynamics are variable and dependant upon temperature, moisture and growing condition of the pasture and rangeland ecosystem. Generally there are two population spikes, in late Spring – early Summer period and late Fall - early Winter periods, requiring multiple applications per paddock per year.

#### **Maximum Number of Applications per Year**

1) Does the "EPA Proposed" Maximum Number of Applications per Year support your stakeholders' malathion needs?

NO, due to YSA population dynamics as stated in 2(iii), above, multiple applications are required to control spread of the insects during the periods when the insect populations are rapidly expanding.

2) If there are instances where the "EPA Proposed" Maximum Number of Applications per Year does not support their malathion needs then:

- (i) What is the maximum number of applications that are needed for this crop?
- (ii) Why do growers need more applications than EPA proposes?

The YSA population dynamics is variable and dependant upon temperature, moisture and growing condition of the pasture and rangeland ecosystem. The YSA population in Hawaii can be maintained year round due to mild climatic conditions in the sub-tropical environment. Generally there are two population spikes, in late Spring – early Summer period and late Fall - early Winter period, requiring multiple applications per paddock per year. A minimum of two applications and a maximum of four applications per paddock per year are recommended.

(iii) How often do growers need more applications than EPA proposes?

This is uncertain as the conditions for YSA is dependant upon climatic conditions, which has been highly variable and inconsistent of the past two decades. The option to allow more than one application per year for crop protection during infestations should be considered.

#### **Minimum Application Interval (days)**

1) Does the "EPA Proposed" Minimum Application Interval support your stakeholders' malathion needs?

There are no "EPA Proposed" Minimum Application Intervals in Table 1.

- 2) If there are instances where the "EPA Proposed" Minimum Application Interval does not support your stakeholders' malathion needs then:
  - (i) What is the Minimum Application Interval that is needed for this crop (in days)?

1 day

Most of the control is done by spot treatment and not the entire pasture area. In pastoral systems, normally there are multiple paddocks which breaks up the whole pasture/grazing area and the animals are rotated to each paddock. The re-treatment interval could be zero days, as long as there were no cattle in the paddock at the time of treatment.

#### **EPA Proposed Restricted Entry Interval (REI)**

(i) Does the *Current* EPA Proposed REI interfere with your stakeholders' typical cultural practices for this crop?

The current REI for grasses, Bermuda and forage does not interfere with typical cultural practices.

The current REI for **pasture** and **rangelands** is in question. We request that the REI be the same interval as for grasses, Bermuda and forage crops; 24 hours REI.

- (ii) How or why does the "Current EPA Proposed" REI interfere with the practices for this crop?
- (iii) What is an acceptable REI for this crop?

  The acceptable REI for pasture and rangelands should be 24 hours.

## **Other Comments**

Malathion has been an important tool for the control of the yellow sugarcane aphid (*Sipha flava*, Forbes) in Hawaiian pastures and rangelands, since the discovery of the insect in the state in 1989. The only formulation available for control of YSA in pastures and rangelands in Hawaii is Clean Crop Malathion 57 EC. At current rates of 0.9375 to 1.25 lb ai/A, malathion provides moderate control of YSA. Multiple applications per paddock per year may be required due to the multiple spikes per year observed in the YSA population dynamics.